

Minutes of the Planning Commission Regular Meeting of **Tuesday, September 5, 2017**
Council Chambers, One Twin Pines Lane, Belmont, CA

ROLL CALL 7:00 P.M.

Planning Commission members Present: Majeski, Hendrix, Mates, Goldfarb, Meola

Planning Commission members Absent: Simpson, McCune

Staff Present: Community Development Director deMelo, City Attorney Rennie, Assistant Planner Dietz, Temporary Administrative Assistant Hernandez

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Led by Chair Mates

COMMUNITY FORUM ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

No one came forward to speak.

COMMISSIONER ANNOUNCEMENTS / AGENDA AMENDMENTS

City Council Meeting of September 12, 2017 - Commission Liaison Goldfarb, Alternate Hendrix.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Draft Meeting Minutes April 4, 2017

Draft Meeting Minutes June 20, 2017

Draft Meeting Minutes July 6, 2017

Draft Meeting Minutes July 18, 2017

ACTION:

Community Development Director deMelo affirmed that we are continuing the four sets of minutes to the September 19, 2017 meeting due to production errors.

SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

NONE

PUBLIC HEARINGS

2856 SAN JUAN BOULEVARD - SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN REVIEW TO CONSTRUCT A 1,648 SQUARE FOOT SINGLE-STORY ADDITION TO THE EXISTING 1,193 SQUARE FOOT SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE. (APPL. NO. PA2017-0027) APN: 043-311-390.

Chair Mates polled the Commission for ex-parte communication regarding the project; Commissioners indicated that site visits were made but no ex-parte communications were made.

Assistant Planner Dietz presented the staff report and stated that the proposed project findings can be made in the affirmative, and recommended approval of the project.

The Commission inquired if staff looked at any sensitive species or databases to determine that the project is not environmentally sensitive.

Assistant Planner Dietz stated that the proposed addition to the single-family home is categorically exempt from the provisions of CEQA 15301, Class 1 (e) (2), which allows additions to existing structures provided that the addition will not result in an increase of more than 10,000 square feet. Since this project is already on an existing project site and in a single family residential neighborhood, it would not substantially alter the existing environment.

Chair Mates opened the Public Hearing, no one came forward to speak.

Chair Mates closed the Public Hearing.

Commission deliberation on the item yielded support for the project. The Commission indicated that the project was well thought-out, fits the current neighborhood and will fit in well with the new construction. Commissioners were able to make all the findings to approve the project.

ACTION: On a Motion Made by Commissioner Goldfarb, Seconded by Commissioner Meola Approving a Single-Family Design Review At 2856 San Juan Boulevard (Appl. No. PA2017-0027).

Passed 5/2 (Simpson absent, McCune absent)
Resolution 2017-28

Chair Mates stated that the Action is appealable within 10 calendar days.

1320 TALBRYN DRIVE - Single-Family Design Review to construct four separate new homes on four newly-subdivided lots. The proposed homes would be 3,545 square feet, 3,404 square feet, 3,745 square feet, and 3,602 square feet. The maximum size permitted for the four lots would be 4,171 square feet, 3,531 square feet, 3,888 square feet, and 3,932 square feet, respectively. (APPL. 2017-0010, 2017-011, 2017-0013, 2017-0014) APN:045-201-190.

Chair Mates polled the Commission for ex-parte communication regarding the project; several Commissioners indicated that site visits were made but no ex-parte communications were made.

Commissioner Meola received an email but did not respond, but wanted to know if that was considered ex-parte communication.

City Attorney Rennie stated that if she received the email and read it, then it would technically be ex-parte communication and the issue would be if it affected her thinking about the project in any way and if it did, it would be the appropriate information to disclose.

Commissioner Meola stated that she received the email, she did not read it in full and it did not affect how she felt about the project.

Commissioner Goldfarb did a site visit and received the same email but it did not affect her thinking.

Commissioner Hendrix received the same email as an invitation to discuss the project; it did not affect his thinking or opinion and he did not contact the owner.

Commissioner Majeski visited the site and received the same email but did not read it and did not have any ex-parte communications.

Commissioner Mates conducted a site visit, she received the same email and responded that it would be more appropriate for the Commission to review the project at the Planning Commission meeting; it did not affect her thinking of the project.

Assistant Planner Dietz stated that there are four projects before them and they are all at 1320 Talbryn Drive, lots 1- 4. There are four separate single-family design review applications; however, he is covering the total project under one presentation since there is overlap between the four design review applications.

Assistant Planner Dietz presented the staff report and provided some history regarding the project.

Project Data for Lot 1; proposed home is a two-story home; the resulting home would be 3,545 square feet, 4,171 square feet is permitted, and the lot size is 14,473 square feet. This site is the most northly lot entering the cul-de-sac.

Three (3) protected trees would be removed, the criteria supporting removal is proximity to proposed structures, and removal is necessary to construct improvements; however, the applicant has proposed to replant one (1) preferred species tree.

The home is well designed and articulated and it minimizes bulk by using a variety of architectural features such as the balconies, a bellyband and the change of materials, and it doesn't impact public views. The site will require minimal grading, and most of the existing trees would remain; the proposed landscaping is appropriate, and the project is in compliance with the Residential Design Guidelines and Residential Design Criteria.

Project Data for Lot 2; proposed home is a two-story home; the resulting home would be 3,404 square feet, and the lot size is 12,259 square feet. This site is located directly to the south of Lot 1, and the house is pushed towards the front of the lot.

Five (5) protected trees are to be removed, the criteria supporting removal is proximity to proposed structures, and removal is necessary to construct improvements; however, the applicant has proposed to replant one (1) preferred species tree.

The home is well designed and articulated, minimizes bulk, and does not impact public views. The site will require minimal grading, is heavily wooded and most of the existing trees would remain; the proposed landscaping is appropriate. The project is in compliance with the Residential Design Guidelines and Residential Design Criteria.

Commissioner McCune arrived at 7:27 P.M.

Project Data for Lot 3. This site is the most unique of the four proposed homes, and the dwelling is tri-level. This home was originally proposed as a two-story home but it had substantial crawl space so staff and the applicant worked together to find a design that better showed compliance with the residential design guidelines; this approach resulted in the tri-level home design. The resulting home would be 3,745 square feet and the lot size is 12,588 square feet.

This site is located south to Lot 2 and is pushed to the front of the lot and in line with the allowable setback. The plans are well articulated, the home has two rear decks, and there is a change of materials on all three levels.

Four (4) protected trees are to be removed, the criteria supporting removal is proximity to proposed structures, and removal is necessary to construct improvements; however, the applicant has proposed to replant two (2) preferred species trees.

The home is well designed and articulated; minimizes bulk, and does not impact public views. The site will require relatively minimal grading, most of the existing trees would remain, and the project is in compliance with the Residential Design Guidelines and Residential Design Criteria.

Project Data for Lot 4. The proposed home is a two-story home, and the resulting home would be 3,602 square feet; 3,932 square feet is permitted, and the lot size is 12,877 square feet.

The home is well designed and articulated, minimizes bulk and does not impact public views. The site will require relatively minimal grading, and all the existing trees would remain. The project is in compliance with the Residential Design Guidelines and Residential Design Criteria.

No tree removal permit is required since no trees are being removed.

The neighborhood concerns were not broken down by lot, but were addressed as one.

- **Erosion and Drainage Issues –**

The potential of water running downhill and a potential for landslides.

These homes were reviewed by the City of Belmont's Public Works department, as well as the applicant's engineers. The applicant's engineers submitted a geotechnical report which provides recommendations for how excavations should be conducted. The geotechnical report was reviewed by the City's independent geotechnical consultant, and the consultant found the applicant's report was satisfactory to address any erosion and drainage issues.

- **Access –**

This concern was addressed in the subdivision as proposed in 2014.

The applicant proposes to introduce a new public road which would involve clearing out the overgrowth for the entrance to Talbryn Drive. In addition, this street would be a public city standard road, which would help with access to the site.

- **Building Bulk and Design Aesthetics –**

Both of these concerns were sufficiently vetted during the design review process. By and large the homes are very well articulated and they comply with the Residential Design Guidelines which help to mitigate bulk.

- **Construction Noise –**

Staff has assigned standard Conditions of Approval that restrict construction hours, construction on weekends, and construction on holidays; this approach will help reduce the construction noise impact felt by the neighbors.

- **Fencing, Story Poles or Similar Markers –**

It was requested that all four homes have required fencing, and that they should include Story Poles or Similar Markers to delineate where exactly the proposed homes would be located. This request was beyond the typical scope of a single-family design project.

Assistant Planner Dietz requested that the applicant and his design team be allowed to make a presentation to address any questions or concerns that the Commission or the public may have.

Navneet Aron, President and CEO, Aron Developers, Inc., stated that they primarily focus on high end, high quality homes that are environmentally sustainable, environmentally conscious and focus on sustainability with zero net energy.

Robert Dowling, Director of Operations, Aron Developers, Inc., shared a brief video presentation of the site as well as the four homes.

Charles Bovet, Vice President of Operations, Bone Structure, stated that they developed a building system for near zero waste and zero energy custom homes.

Kim Landry, Project Lead for Design Phase, Bone Structure. The architectural intention was to create four energy efficient home designs, maximizing comfort while having minimal impact on their surroundings which centers on location, the protection of existing trees for natural screening, building performance as well as the architectural essence.

Carlos deMelo, Community Development Director stated that staff did receive some Commission comments on the project and that staff responded to those comments. This was part of an original subdivision that was approved in 2014. The City did not take traffic and the access issues lightly when the project was originally conceived. The project was reviewed by multiple traffic engineers, including the City's Parking, Traffic and Safety committee. A whole host of site improvements were proposed and are required to be installed as part of the project. The graph that staff provided to the Commission provides an overview of traffic improvements that are going to be required for

the project. Improvements include a three way stop at the entrance to the cul-de-sac, as well as on Talbryn Drive, speed warning signage, and other improvements.

Discussion ensued regarding street parking, the road being too narrow and if the road would be expanded. Carlos deMelo, Community Development Director stated that one side of the road leading into the cul-de-sac will have street parking and that the actual bulb of the cul-de-sac will be red curbed so parking won't be allowed along that portion. He also stated that the road must be modified to accommodate the actual construction of the four homes as well as to provide access to emergency vehicles.

Discussion ensued regarding the other measures that will be addressed including taking out the vegetation, the size of the sidewalk, and how far the sidewalk would be extended and what other measures are in place regarding the ingress/egress.

Scott Rennie, Belmont City Attorney stated that the Commission was discussing something that was part of the 2014 tentative map approval. As such we are reviewing history at this point as opposed to looking at things that are part of tonight's application.

Peter Carlino, Lea & Braze Engineering, Inc., They are the civil engineers on the project and they did the subdivision improvements. They are installing a six-foot sidewalk all the way out to Talbryn Drive and all the way into the cul-de-sac, and wrapping the cul-de-sac. They implemented all the traffic control measures listed in the tentative map, they didn't contest any measures, and agreed to all of them as they implemented the subdivision. The intent was not to change what they implemented in the past. The vegetation will be cut down to improve view triangles, to the clear line of sight and what is in the right of way and what they can take down. There are standard OEM agreements as part of the private road being built to a public standard, all listed in the subdivision. The reduction in speed will be 10 mph along Talbryn Drive as you come down the hill and enter the three-way intersection to make sure you are not traveling too fast around the corner. There will be striping on the ground with standard signs, and street lights will be added in the cul-de-sac.

Discussion ensued regarding minor differences in Conditions of Approval and potential problems from having runoff or damage to the side of the hill during construction since there is a steep cut in the back side of the homes on Rose Lane.

Assistant Planner Dietz stated that there are a couple of differences in the Lots, one is on Lot 4, since they are not proposing to remove trees. The Condition to replace the trees was removed. Lot 1 required extra lighting per the Belmont Police Department. Assistant Planner Dietz stated that construction safety regarding the stability went through multiple levels of review, from our City engineers in the Public Works department, to the applicants' geotechnical engineer and the City's independent geotechnical consultant to ensure the stability of the hillside.

Discussion ensued regarding resident concerns. Assistant Planner Dietz stated that some individual concerns were addressed by the design review process and some were not able to be addressed, such as the fencing, the story poles and construction noise, which will be mitigated by the

Conditions of Approval. There were efforts to help minimize concerns where applicable but the issue with the fencing and the story poles were not altered to reflect the feedback.

Navneet Aron, Aron Developers, Inc., specified that he spoke with the concerned resident on multiple occasions and that they discussed the neighborhood concerns. Aron Developers, Inc., has offered to walk the area and see the homes as they are being framed. If they need to plant any trees for privacy, then Aron Developers, Inc. will plant those trees on the neighbor's property at Aron Developers, Inc. costs or on one of the four lots. Construction noise would be minimal since they are working with Bone Structure who can build the homes with simple tools at a very rapid pace.

Carlos deMelo, Community Development Director responded to a question from the Commission regarding a Construction Management Plan; he stated that there are Construction Management Plan Conditions which describe all the various components that need to be in the Construction Management Plan. The project was required to be conditioned appropriately to address construction impacts.

Commissioner Mates opened the Public Hearing

David Kramer, Belmont resident, spoke in support of the project.

Jeff Kraft, Belmont resident, spoke in support of the project.

Bruce Gutmen, Belmont resident, spoke in support of the project.

Commissioner Mates closed the Public Hearing

Commission deliberation concluded that the project is well articulated and findings can be made.

ACTION: On a Motion by Commissioner Goldfarb and Seconded by Commissioner Meola Approving a Single-Family Design Review and Tree Removal Permit at 1320 Talbryn Drive, Lot #1 (Appl. No. PA2017-0011).

Passed 6/1 (Simpson absent)
Resolution 2017-29

ACTION: On a Motion by Commissioner Goldfarb and Seconded by Commissioner Majeski Approving a Single-Family Design Review and Tree Removal Permit at 1320 Talbryn Drive, Lot #2 (Appl. No. PA2017-0010).

Passed 6/1 (Simpson absent)
Resolution 2017-30

ACTION: On a Motion by Commissioner Meola and Seconded by Commissioner Majeski Approving a Single-Family Design Review and Tree Removal at 1320 Talbryn Drive, Lot #3 (Appl. No. PA2017-0013).

Passed 6/1 (Simpson absent)
Resolution 2017-31

ACTION: On a Motion by Commissioner Meola and Seconded by Commissioner McCune Approving a Single-Family Design Review at 1320 Talbryn Drive, Lot #4 (Appl. No. PA2017-0014).

Passed 6/1 (Simpson absent)
Resolution 2017-32

Chair Mates stated that the actions are appealable within 10 calendar days.

OTHER BUSINESS / UPDATES

Community Development Director deMelo indicated that Consultants and staff are currently reviewing all comments received on the General Plan Update and the City anticipates the draft response to comments will be ready in about a week. Any final documents related to the Final Environmental Impact Report should be prepared and released for the public the third week of September. The City is targeting public hearings for the first week in October, and staff has prepared a draft schedule that will be released to the public shortly. After the October Planning Commission meetings, the Project will transition to the City Council at the end of October Policy Document Review and Adoption. The Commission meetings will run in an Open House format. The Open House will start at 6:00 pm and will have story boards, plans, documents, etc. and will be held in the EOC room.

Residents will be notified of the public meeting via the City's website as well and by community outreach through Facebook, NextDoor, email blast, etc.

ADJOURNMENT: at this time being 8:35 P.M. to a regular meeting of the Planning Commission to be held on September 19, 2017.

Irma Hernandez
Temporary Administrative Assistant

Meeting televised and web streamed.